



## Orange City Development Services Department

205 East Graves Avenue, Orange City, Florida 32763

[www.OurOrangeCity.com](http://www.OurOrangeCity.com) Phone: 386-775-5415 Fax: 386-775-5420

---

### MEMORANDUM

**Public Meeting:** January 18, 2018 Historic Preservation Board

**Report Date:** January 17, 2018

**Agenda Item:** 5D

**Permit No.:** COMB-1-18-17889

**Subject:** Commercial remodel permit including demolition of exterior elements

**Location:** 258 E. Graves Avenue

**Applicant:** J & M Roofing, Michael Kohler

**Staff:** Kimberly Reading, Planner 1

**Owner(s):** Ivan Torres, Twin Action Enterprise

#### SUMMARY OF REPORT

The owner is seeking approval for exterior renovations of a multi-family commercial structure on his property located at 258 E. Graves Avenue to demolish the existing metal roof followed by replacement with architectural asphalt shingles.

Section 2-103. (4), Demolition, of the Code of Ordinances Division 3 - Historic Preservation Board, requires that this demolition be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Board.

***Staff recommendation:***

*Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board approve the requested rehabilitation with the conditions identified in staff analysis.*

**BACKGROUND**

According to the Volusia County Property Appraiser, the two-story apartment building at 258 E. Graves Ave was constructed in 1915. It is listed as a contributing structure to the Orange City National Register Historic District. Newspapers of the day indicate banker and developer, John W. Camac, repurposed the old Library and Hall into the Laverne Apartments. Since that time, this location has maintained a multifamily residential use, although the property changed hands several times over the years. The current owner, Twin Action Enterprise, purchased the property in August 2013, and intends to continue its use as a multifamily residential dwelling.



Figure 1 - Laverne Apartments c.1930



Figure 2 - East Graves Avenue Apartments 2018

The 102 year old frame vernacular structure with stucco exterior appears to be largely unaltered since it was constructed in 1915. The only noticeable modification to the structure's exterior is the application of architectural shingles on the front and rear porches. The structure was in a deteriorated state when the current owner acquired the property. Mr. Torres with Twin Action Enterprise has since invested in the site by installing new sidewalks, making necessary plumbing repairs and installing new windows in several units. On January 11, 2018, a building permit application was submitted to the City for a new roof to be installed over the base structure.

The Applicant seeks approval for partial demolition of a 102 year old historic structure that includes removal of the existing metal roof, a wood shingle system beneath it, and the roof substrate, followed by reconstruction of the deck and replacement with a dissimilar material, architectural asphalt shingle in charcoal color. The proposed change in material requires the principal structure roof deck to be upgraded to support the new shingles, which is a structural change in the design of the building.



Figure 3 - Timberline HD Charcoal



Figure 3 - South facade of apartments 2018

City Council adopted Ordinance 568 on April 25, 2017 amending the Historic Preservation Program regulating demolition of Historic Properties. Per Section 2-103.3(4), *Board Review Process (Major)*, any building permit impacting properties listed in the National Register of Historic Places shall be reviewed by the Board. Therefore, any permit for demolition activities to the exterior of the historic structure shall be reviewed in accordance with the ordinance.

**STAFF ANALYSIS**

In order to improve the structure’s appearance and preserve the structural integrity, the applicant proposes to remove the existing metal roof that was applied over historic wood shingles. It is not known when the metal roof was installed, but the roof is currently in a state of disrepair. The applicant also proposes to remove the wood shingles and all substrate. The applicant will then reconstruct the roof system from the trusses with a new deck and the addition of a ridge vent system. The proposed roof reconstruction will include measures to preserve the historic slope and spatial relationship with the surrounding structures.

The applicant proposes to add a ridge vent system to augment the existing gable vents. Staff recommends the vent system be installed off-ridge on the southern façade to maintain the appearance of the existing historic roof. The applicant has not proposed changes to the existing porch roof covering. The proposed roof color will match the existing metal roof. The owner has stated that he is replacing the portion of the roof over the main structure to satisfy requirements of his property insurance provider. Mr. Torres stated he will continue to make improvements to the site, including upgrading the porch roof system and applying fresh paint.



Figure 4 - Existing North façade roof

**CRITERIA FOR REVIEWING DEMOLITION PERMITS**

According to Section 2-103.3 (5), *Review Criteria*, the Historic Preservation Board shall use the following criteria when making a decision to approve, approve with conditions, to delay approval for up to 180 days to identify project alternatives, or deny the permit application:

- A. The building or structure is of such interest or quality that it would reasonably meet national standards for additional designation on the National Register of Historic Places or as a National Historic Landmark.**

This is a contributing structure to the Orange City National Register Historic District.

**B. The building, structure, or object contributes substantially to the ambiance of a district and the historical area's sense of place.**

This two-story apartment building is a significant structure in the city's historic core on East Graves Avenue. Currently, the roof system utilizes two dissimilar and contrasting materials, tan shingles and a painted metal roof. Previous owners installed asphalt shingles to the existing porch roofs prior to the adoption of Ordinance 568. Application of shingles to the remainder of the structure will unify the materials applied to the entire roof structure. The proposed roof rehabilitation will improve the integrity of structure and its overall appearance. Staff finds that proposed asphalt shingle roof covering will not significantly alter the area's sense of place and therefore, recommends the Board approve the proposed change to the principal structure roof covering.

**C. The building, structure or object is of such design, texture, material, detail, or unique location that it would be of great difficulty and/or expense to reproduce.**

The proposed demolition of the historic metal roof and underlying substrate will alter the design, texture and detail of the structure. However, the applicant has stated the proposed roof decking will support the application of a metal roof a later date, if desired. Staff finds the proposed alterations will not be of great difficulty to reproduce and recommends the Board approve the proposed roof structural modifications. Staff also recommends the owner provide a sample of the historic wood shingle to the city to preserve a historic record of the structures original construction. Additionally, the artisan and architectural salvage community may have interest in the historic wood shakes. Staff recommends the owner allow salvage activities of historic resources, provided the Board finds there are salvageable materials within the site.

**D. The building, structure, or object is one of the last remaining examples of its kind in the neighborhood, the county, or the region.**

The Frame Vernacular design is similar to other structures of this period in the district. However, this 102 year old structure is the last remaining two-story multifamily structure constructed during this era of the city's history. The proposed roof reconstruction is proposed to ensure the structure will remain a viable structure in the future.

**E. Definite plans exist for redevelopment of the property if the proposed demolition is carried out, and those plans will have a positive effect on the character of the surrounding properties.**

The request is for partial demolition of a historic metal roof and substrate, replaced by asphalt shingles. The new roof will improve the aesthetics of the site and may stimulate additional property improvements in the area. With the recommended conditions, staff finds there will be minimal negative impact to the site. The roof demolition and reconstruction will likely have

a positive effect on the character of the surrounding properties while providing a historic record of the structure.

- F. A reasonable effort was made to relocate or save the building, structure, or object from collapse.** The current owners purchased the property in 2014 and have provided ordinary maintenance to the site as needed. The proposed roof rehabilitation includes efforts to stabilize and weatherproof the structure, thereby protecting the envelope of the structure to ensure the longevity of its useful life.
- G. Retention of the building or structure would promote the general welfare of the city by providing an opportunity for the study of local history, architecture, or design.** The structure is reportedly reconstructed from the original Hall and Library (and former Orange City Hotel c.1880) that once faced E. Graves Avenue. It should be noted, that the Hall and Library survived the great fire of March 12, 1909 that destroyed multiple structures along East Graves and North Oak Avenues. The library was relocated to its present location in 1919. Preservation of this structure provides an opportunity to study local history and architecture that existed in during the founding years of Orange City. Staff recommends the owner provide samples of the historic wood shingles to the city for archival purposes as well as solicit the salvage of historic resources.
- H. Demolition of the building or structure has been recommended or ordered by the building official due to unsafe conditions.** The Building Official has not recommended or ordered action due to unsafe conditions.

## RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Historic Preservation Board approve the building permit with the following conditions:

1. Roof vents shall be installed off-ridge along the southern roof slope to maintain the historic roofline.
2. Property owner shall provide a pictorial record of the building's historical and architectural features for archival purposes.

*Photographs shall document the structure's exterior and interior features as made evident during the roof demolition. The photographic record shall be provided to the city and will be maintained by the Development Services Department.*
3. Property owner shall allow salvage activities of historic resource, provided the Board finds there are salvageable materials within the site and provide a sample of the historic wood shingles to the City for archival purposes.

## ATTACHMENTS

Florida Master Site File